



*Final Assessment Report  
of Main Professional Education Program  
on Higher Education*

*MASTER'S DEGREE IN ECONOMICS*

**'ACCOUNTING, INTERNAL CONTROL AND AUDIT'**

**People's Friendship University of Russia (RUDN)**

**FACULTY OF ECONOMICS**



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Information on the accreditation procedure .....	3
II. Panel members report .....	4
Introduction: aims, structure and general provisions of the accreditation procedure .....	4
Review of the institutional profile of the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN) ...	4
III. Introduction: aims, structure and general provisions of the accreditation procedure .....	6
IV. Overall assessment.....	6
V. Assessment of key quality criteria .....	8
CRITERION 1. PUBLIC INFORMATION AVAILABLE .....	8
CRITERION 2. QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM.....	9
CRITERION 3. DESIGN, ORGANIZATION AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROGRAM ....	11
CRITERION 4. ACADEMIC FACULTY .....	15
CRITERION 5. INFRASTRUCTURES, FACILITIES AND RESOURCES.....	17
CRITERION 6. LEARNING OUTCOMES.....	18
CRITERION 7. SATISFACTION AND PERFORMANCE INDICATORS .....	18

## I. Information on the accreditation procedure

Subject of the accreditation procedure

Educational programme	Degree to be acquired	ETCS	Duration	Form of education	Language of instruction
MASTER IN ECONOMICS ACCOUNTING, INTERNAL CONTROL AND AUDIT	MASTER	120	2 years	Full-time	Main - Russian

Date of on-site visit: 7-8 June 2018.

Panel members:

**María Paz Espinosa** – Full Professor of Economics, University of the Basque Country.

**Antonio Padilla** – Full Professor of Management and Entrepreneurship University of Málaga.

**Igor Zhuravlyov** – Managing Partner in REANDA RusAudit; member of the Executive board of “OPORA ROSSII”; vice-president of the Institute of Financial Accountants and of the International Association of Book-keepers.

**Tatiana Turisheva** – Ph.D. in Economics, Assistant Professor, Department of Taxation and Book-Keeping, Plekhanov Russian University of Economics.

**Sofia Rakitina** – Student at the Plekhanov Russian University of Economics.

The Panel had the assistance of Anna Soloveva from AKKORK.

## II. Panel members report

### *Introduction: aims, structure and general provisions of the accreditation procedure*

DEVA and AKKORK (DEVA: Department of Evaluation and Accreditation, Córdoba, Spain; AKKORK: Autonomous Non-Profit Organization Agency for Higher Education Quality Assurance and Career Development, Moscow, Russia), agencies for assessment, accreditation, and control of the quality of education and career development, have signed an agreement on cooperation in international accreditation of educational programs in the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN) (Moscow, Russia). To this end, a panel group was created, consisting of two Spanish reviewers (university professors) with the assistance of three Russian reviewers from the academic and extra-academic environment including representatives of the student community.

All members of the group participated in a two-day visit to the university in June 2018. During the visit, meetings and interviews were held with the university's top management, the Dean, students and graduates of all educational programs under evaluation, as well as with employers and with the teaching staff. Earlier, the University had provided AKKORK with a self-assessment report and additional documents, which were later translated into English and forwarded to the agency DEVA and the international members of the reviewers' committee. The evaluation of educational programs by the reviewers is based on the provided written material, the additional documents provided on request, and the results of the visit.

### *Review of the institutional profile of the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN)*

Russia joined the Bologna process in 2003 and since then has consistently adhered to the basic objectives of the Bologna Declaration at the national and institutional levels. Part of this process was the introduction of a two-cycle system of education at the national level in accordance with the "Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area". The program for the first cycle usually last 4 years and graduates acquire a bachelor's degree. The second cycle includes two years of study and ends with a master's degree. Graduates can later continue their education to pursue a PhD (PhD - Doctor of Philosophy), and then the Doctor of Sciences. It should be noted that the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN) is a pioneer in the introduction of the Bologna process in the educational system of the Russian Federation.

Federal state educational standards define the learning outcomes of each educational program at each level of qualification. The structure and content of the curriculum depends largely on the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation. All bachelor's and master's programs consist of several modules, that is, courses from different disciplinary areas. The educational programs do not focus only on a specific educational area, but offer more general education, such as the humanities and the social sciences. This is especially true for bachelor students.

Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN) was founded on February 5, 1960 by the decision of the Government of the USSR. On February 22, 1961, the University was named after Patrice Lumumba - one of the symbols of the struggle for the independence of the peoples of Africa. The Russian language classes at the preparatory faculty for foreign students began in 1960, and at the six basic faculties of the University (Engineering, History and Philology, Medical, Agricultural, Physical, Mathematical and Natural Sciences, Economics and Law) - on September 1, 1961. In 1964, the University became a member of the International Association of Universities (IAU).

Nowadays, the structure of RUDN comprises 5 main faculties: Faculty of Physics, Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Faculty of Ecology, Faculty of Philology, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, Faculty of Economics, Engineering Academy; and 10 institutes: Medical Institute, Law Institute, Institute of Foreign Languages, Agrarian-technological Institute, Institute of World Economy and Business, Institute of Hospitality Business and Tourism, Academic Research Institute of Gravitation and Cosmology, Institute of Medical and Biological Problems, Academic Research Institute of Comparative Educational Policy, and Institute of Space Technologies.

The distinctive features of the educational process at RUDN are:

- Credit system ECTS.
- European Diploma Supplement.
- Worldwide academic mobility.
- Up to 800 academic hours of foreign languages learning.
- Diploma in translation (2-3 foreign languages).
- Over 1500 courses for continuing education.
- All levels of education (master, PhD, DSi, Clinical residency, internship).
- Teaching in foreign languages.

RUDN has the right to set its own educational standards (sanctioned by Russian President, 2012).

The University has a team consisting of more than 5,000 employees, among them - about 2,500 teachers, including 500 academics and doctors, more than 1,200 professors and candidates of science, 57 full and correspondent members of the Russian Academy of Science and field-specific academies, 28 Honored Scientists of Russia, and 26 full members of foreign academies and scientific societies.

The educational process and research activities of the University are supported by the sufficient infrastructure, material resources and technical equipment. For example, the following indicators can describe the fully computerized library of RUDN:

- Library branches and reading halls in 5 University buildings,
- More than 17,000 users,
- 1,800,000 copies and library items at the library stock.
- Online access to more than 36 foreign and Russian databases.
- 90,000 foreign literature pieces in 70 languages.

- Electronic collections of RUDN professors' publications.
- The University has 45 educational and scientific centers and 150 scientific laboratories.

The outcome of the work of professors' and researchers of RUDN includes: 870 copyright certificates, 160 patents of the Russian Federation and 2 scientific inventions, and 84 certificates for computer programs and databases (RUDN intellectual rights).

According to international ratings, RUDN is included in the World Top-500 in the QS World University Rankings. In 2011-2014, in the annual National universities, Interfax and Echo proposed an assessment of Moscow RUDN in a ranking of 4-6th among all Russian universities, and the most internationalized university.

### III. Introduction: aims, structure and general provisions of the accreditation procedure

Albeit, currently, there is not an internationally agreed protocol for assessing the quality of the higher educational degrees, it seems appropriate to employ criteria roughly analogous to those that would apply if the evaluated institution were located in the same country as the agency. Therefore, the seven criteria used in this report correspond, with some necessary adaptations, to the structure of the Quality Handbook elaborated to that effect by the Andalusian Agency for University Quality Evaluation and Accreditation (DEVA). Specifically, this evaluation process relies on the last edition of the "Guide for Renewing the Accreditation of University Bachelor's and Master's Degrees in Andalusia".

For each of these seven criteria, it was chosen one of four possible ratings, namely:

- "Fully conform",
- "Substantially compliant",
- "Partially compliant", and
- "Not compliant".

As applied here, the latter implies very serious shortcomings and might, depending on the criteria in question, originate an unfavorable overall assessment. A rating as "Partially compliant" implies some shortcomings, sometimes severe enough to demand changes in some aspects of the educational process. A "Substantially compliant" rating implies a satisfactory situation; however, there may be some, or even considerable, room for improvement. "Fully conform" corresponds to excellent quality. Therefore, whatever the rating chosen for each criterion, the stakeholders are encouraged to pay close attention to the provided comments and recommendations.

### IV. Overall assessment



After studying the self-assessment report, a vast range of internal documents, and holding extensive on-site meetings with the program's administrators, management, teaching staff, students, graduates and employers, as well as with staff of RUDN's quality management, the panel has a favorable opinion about the quality of the program. It is worth noting that the program has a high degree of practical orientation, which provides graduates appropriate skills and knowledge.

We are confident that the program's management and faculty, in close cooperation with relevant stakeholders at the University level, are fully committed to the objective of permanently monitoring and improving the program's quality. The favorable overall rating reflects recognition of past achievements and an expectation of further progress in that respect.

The University is committed to a continuous improvement of the learning process and outcomes in line with international standards. In this context, the present report contains suggestions and recommendations for further improvement.

***Assessment: FULLY CONFORM***

## V. Assessment of key quality criteria

### CRITERION 1.PUBLIC INFORMATION AVAILABLE

#### *Comments*

In the Master's webpage (<http://www.rudn.ru/ab/?pagec=5309>), there is specific information about the objectives of the program, competences, internships, career and employment prospects, learning outcomes, Master's subjects, material resources and infrastructures and extracurricular activities. Under "Documentation", there is a more detailed description of the program and competences (Description of the educational program and Academic plan), as well as information on the cost of the program, educational loans, etc. The implementation of the degree is very recent so that only one group has graduated. Therefore, there is little information about the previous results of the program. The information about admission to the program is common for all Master programs. The link <http://www.rudn.ru/ab/admissions> contains instructions about how to apply for admission, housing, etc.

There is also general information about this program in other webpages of different institutions, for example:

<https://studyinrussia.ru/en/study-in-russia/programs/132741-accounting-internal-control-and-audit/description/>

with a link to RUDN School of Economics: <http://www.econ-rudn.ru/> and from there to this Master's program:

[http://www.econ-rudn.ru/magistr/economics/buhuchet\\_vnutrenniy\\_kontrol\\_i\\_audit/](http://www.econ-rudn.ru/magistr/economics/buhuchet_vnutrenniy_kontrol_i_audit/)

The information in pdf format cannot be translated easily and, for this reason, it would be better to avoid this document format on the webpage. Even though the language of instruction is Russian, so that prospective students do have access to that information, it is better to provide the relevant information in an accessible format so as not to limit the potential international audience of the master degree.

To sum up, the public information available could be better structured and organized for accessibility. During the visit, the head of the program informed that they were undergoing a process of centralization and integration of the information about the program in a single website.

Finally, the information about quality management procedures is available in <http://quality.rudn.ru/?pagec=878>, but this is not linked to the main web of the Master. The information about the accreditation process, and the self-assessment report should be made available in the web, as well as any legal report from any governmental body about the Master, and the European supplement of the Master.

### ***Recommendations***

RECOMMENDATION 1.- It is recommended to centralize and integrate in a single web page the public information available, avoiding PDF format.

RECOMMENDATION 2.- Although there is information about the faculty on the web page, this should be made more easily available to prospective students in a standard format, including subjects taught, short CV, office hours, etc.

RECOMMENDATION 3.- Information about quality management procedures, that is available in the webpage of the Quality Management System, should be linked to the main web of the Master. The information about the accreditation process, and the self-assessment report should also be available in the web, as well as any legal report from any governmental body about the Master, and the European supplement of the Master.

RECOMMENDATION 4.- It is recommended that more detailed information is provided on the web page. In particular, indicators such as graduation rate, dropout rate, etc., the recommended profile for new students, regulation on the Credit Transfer and Recognition System and any other relevant regulation. It would be also useful to provide more information about the Agreement on Joint Student Training in Economics with the Tajik National University (TNU) and the Russian-Tajik (Slavonic) University, the Agreement with the Chartered Institute of Management Accountants (CIMA), and the recognition of the evaluated Master by the IFA-Institute of Financial Analysts.

***Assessment:*** SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLIANT

## **CRITERION 2. QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM**

### ***Comments***

The programme has a Quality Management System and a Quality Assurance Programme, which are part of the University's Strategic Development Plan. This programme includes a quality policy, a quality management model, a quality assurance service (it follows the ISO 9000:2000 and the European Quality Assurance Standard), and quality assurance programme. In addition, for the centralized collection of quality data, the department of Education Programs Quality Assurance cooperates with RUDN Educational Policy Office educational units. Moreover, annual reports on the implementation of the Learning Quality Programme are discussed at

meetings with members from different organisational levels, including the Rector. In these meetings, decisions and measures are taken to improve the educational processes.

A quality report is published online, titled "Learning Quality at the RUDN" (<http://quality.rudn.ru/?pagec=884>).

A system of feedback exists and also some satisfaction surveys:

- For students (at least once every three years).
- For teaching staff (at least once every three years).
- For graduates and employers (annually by faculty groups).

These are published in Russian in the web page (<http://quality.rudn.ru/?pagec=886>) in PDF format.

It is worth mentioning the Education Quality Committee (a student self-government body that is part of the RUDN Student Council). Several procedures ensure fluid communication between the RUDN Learning Quality Committee and students: information pages on social media and boxes for questions/suggestions/complaints. Also noteworthy is the existence of "Open Dialog" (<http://www.rudn.ru/open-dialog>), where a form is available for students, employees, and teaching staff to submit suggestions or complaints regarding the quality of education.

The quality assurance system uses indicators to identify the achievement of specific objectives. In this Master's degree the main problems identified are the absence of publications indexed in the Web of Science, and the lack of external/internal funding for research.

The university has a well organized quality system, which provides enough indicators about the management and improvement of the program. However, some documentation related to the members of the committee and the results of the decision making should be more accessible in the web.

In addition, it is advisable to provide evidences supporting that the recommendations of the different external reports and the improvement proposals derived from the monitoring process have been effectively incorporated into the planning and development of the programme.

Finally, the information provided about the implementation of the improvement proposals is not sufficient. For example, some measures are mentioned to improve Indicator 4 "The number of publications indexed in the Web of Science international database" and Indicator 10 "Funding" (Pril\_2.1), but these measures are not appropriately specified, more detail should be provided about these improvement proposals.

### ***Recommendations***

RECOMMENDATION 5.- It is recommended to provide public information about any Improvement Plans derived from the analysis and review of the results of the indicators and the reviews carried out in the Quality Management System.

RECOMMENDATION 6.- When reporting the results of satisfaction and performance surveys,

it is recommended that the participation rate is reported, to assess the reliability of the results.

**Assessment:** SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLIANT

### CRITERION 3. DESIGN, ORGANIZATION AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROGRAM

#### *Comments*

The first enrolment in the programme took place in 2015. This Master is a professionally oriented programme, and this is highly regarded by all the stakeholders, students, graduates and employers.

As a professionally oriented programme, it has a practice driven approach to its contents and implementation, which allows a flexible response to recent changes in the professional environment as well as labour market demands. It is positive that a number of practitioners are recruited to implement the programme, including representatives of world's leading audit companies, such as PWC, EY, and Deloitte, which enables students to fully master the professional competences.

When an updating of the programme becomes necessary, the opinion of all parties is taken into account (students, teachers, and representatives of employers, as well as the professional community, as subject syllabus may include cases based on real situations). There is a continuous control and adjustment of the learning process as the auditing, internal control and auditing topics are related to a changing regulation (Russian legislation as well as international accounting and auditing regulations).

The coordinator informed the Panel that they were studying a change in the Elective disciplines. During the visit, the Panel did detect some demand for more contents on Internal Control, so some consideration could be given to the possibility of including this type of contents.

The admission to Master's programmes is based on the written interdisciplinary examination in Economics, which is assessed on a 100-point scale as an admission test.

According to the curriculum, the equalizing subject "Basic Methodology and Objectives of Accounting" is offered to freshmen students whose background education lies outside of the sphere of the Master, so that they can acquire further knowledge in accounting and audit. Internships are well organised, with individual assignments by the mentor that corresponds to the research subject and, upon the completion of practice, a progress report is prepared and presented to a board of teachers of the chair who are members of the professional audit organization.

According to the self-assessment report, the programme envisages 52 weeks of theoretical instruction, 14 weeks of work experience/internship/pre-degree practice, 2 weeks to prepare for and take the state examination, and 4 weeks to prepare and present students' graduation thesis (Pril\_1.8).

The report also mentions that the programme consists of three blocs:

Bloc 1 "Subjects (Modules)", which includes the subjects (modules) included in the basic part of the programme as well as the elective ones.

Bloc 2 "Practical Activities, Including Research Work", which belongs entirely to the elective part of the programme.

Bloc 3 "State Final Examination", which belongs entirely to the basic part of the programme and ends with the qualification of Master of Economics.

Subjects that belong to the basic part of the Master's programme are mandatory for all students. The set of basic disciplines is determined by RUDN. This part includes the following subjects: Advanced Microeconomics, Advanced Macroeconomics, Advanced Econometrics, and Professional Foreign Language.

Bloc 2 includes 27 credit units of research work and 21 credit units of pre-degree practice.

Bloc 3 "State Final Examination" includes graduate qualification work presentation, in particular preparation for the presentation and the presentation proper (6 credit units) as well as preparation for and taking of the state final examination (3 credit units).

The workload with intramural education is 60 credit units per year. A credit unit is 36 hours.

The structure of the Master is available as a link to a PDF in Russian, a scanned document. As mentioned before, this document format makes it difficult the translation into English for an international audience.

Information about the subjects, credits and programming in the four semesters is available on the web:

[http://www.rudn.ru/files\\_upload/Education/2015/2015-12-05/%D0%AD%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%BD%D0%BE%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B8%D0%B9/EEm+d4\\_Econ\\_BUVKiA\\_2015/Ucheb\\_plan/Ucheb\\_plan\\_EemKd4\\_BUVKiA\\_2015.pdf](http://www.rudn.ru/files_upload/Education/2015/2015-12-05/%D0%AD%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%BD%D0%BE%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B8%D0%B9/EEm+d4_Econ_BUVKiA_2015/Ucheb_plan/Ucheb_plan_EemKd4_BUVKiA_2015.pdf)

- Core courses:
  - o Microeconomics (advanced level).
  - o Macroeconomics (advanced level).
  - o Econometrics.
- Variable part:
  - Legal regulation.
  - Financial Accounting (advanced course).

- Formation and Control of tax bases.
- Professional foreign language integrated reporting: the principles of setting and keeping in banks.
- Management accounting system acceptance and rationale analysis of business valuation.
- IFRS practical course.
- Practical auditing.
- B.2. Practices, including NIRM.

There is a document, provided as evidence, with the Electives, which are:

- 3 credit units (108 hours)
  - o Methodology and Goals of Accounting.
  - o Legal Regulation of Business and Foreign Economic Activity.
  - o Forming and Controlling Tax Bases.
  - o Corporate Social Responsibility (in English).
  - o Accounting of Foreign Economic Operations (same program than next one).
  - o International Settlement Accounting (same program than previous one),
- 2 credit units (72 hours)
  - o Industry-Specific Accounting (B.1B.B.9).
  - o Service Accounting.
  - o International Business Analytics.
  - o The Fundamental Concepts of IRFSs.
- 4 credit units (144 hours)
  - o Internal Control.
  - o Internal Audit.

Additional information can be found in the virtual campus:

(<http://esystem.pfur.ru/course/index.php?categoryid=830>), with detailed information about the subjects:

- Intrafirm control.
- Internal audit.
- Accounting operations for foreign trade activities.
- International Business Intelligence (special course of choice).

- Accounting services.
- Accounting of foreign economic operations.
- Accounting for international payments.
- International Standards on Auditing.
- Accounting financial accounting (advanced course).
- Integrated reporting.
- Methodology of economic analysis.
- Legal regulation.
- Practical audit.
- Practical IFRS course.
- Methodological fundamentals and targets of accounting.
- Management accounting.
- Accounting in the branches.
- Formation and control of taxable bases.
- Economic statistics.
- Business Analysis and Valuation.

The programme includes 6 credit units for a course in Professional Foreign Language.

In the virtual campus, the information provided about each subject includes, among others, competences, evaluation criteria, and relevant material.

More generally, the programme focuses on training new-generation experts (analysts and researchers) in accounting, audit, and analysis who are capable of developing and implementing financial strategies to ensure efficient and safe development of the business both in the Russian market and at a global scale. The programme allows pursuing a PhD programme after its completion.

The programme is well organised around the specific proposed subjects which cover the main educative elements of the Master.

Mobility, management of internships and master dissertation are well organised.

The master's programme is a professionally oriented programme that is assessed by all parties in interest: students, graduates and employers. It is recommended to include the internal audit disciplines into the elective part of the master's programme.

**Assessment:** FULLY COMPLIANT

## CRITERION 4. ACADEMIC FACULTY

### *Comments*

The Head of the programme is the Chair of Accounting, Audit and Statistics. There are several evidences that support the suitability of the academic faculty for the development of the program.

Two thirds of the members of the Faculty involved in programme implementations are active in the professional sphere or have a practical experience of over 15 years. In particular, among the faculty there are active auditors and holders of qualification certificates issued by the RF Ministry of Finance, tax consultants, certified professional accountants, and have practical experience as accountants and holding a professional certificate in accounting; even recognised by the Institute of Professional Accountants for major contribution to the professional community and continuous professional improvement. There is also a chartered expert in state accreditation and an expert of the Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Career Development for public professional accreditation.

The faculty is also active in the publication of textbooks and teaching aids in financial analysis, management accounting, taxation, etc.

Leading experts from world-famous audit companies regularly contribute to training sessions and workshops that take place within the programme.

In terms of academic categories, areas of knowledge, teaching experience, and professional experience, the faculty is well suited for this Master degree.

The Faculty carries out research activities; the results are presented in numerous works published in Russian in academic journals and used in the learning process. In addition, they have published a number of textbooks and teaching aids in accounting, audit, financial analysis, IFRSs, and statistics; the textbooks in audit and financial analysis are approved by the Educational and Methodological Association for Higher Education.

Moreover, the academic staff's basic education corresponds to the subjects that they teach. Practitioners in Audit take advanced training of 40 hours on a yearly basis in compliance with the requirements of the RF Ministry of Finance. In addition, teachers attend training sessions and workshops organized by employers as well as seminars and conferences.

Supervision of Masters theses (for 2015, 2016, and 2017 enrolments) are detailed with the name of the supervisor and the title of the Master dissertation.

Supervision of Practice/Internship (2017 graduation) is also detailed, with the name of the teacher supervisor and the company. Some students in the Master's programme choose to take pre-degree practice at the premises of the computer room of Action Gruppa Glavbukh LLC at

RUDN University, although most of them prefer to do it in external organizations (this is confirmed by the students report on practice). Additionally, the students can take special programmes at the Glavbukh School and receive a professional re-training certificate, in particular in compliance with the Accountant professional standard (<http://school.glavbukh.ru/programs/180314>).

All members of the Faculty involved in implementing the programme are Master thesis supervisors as well, and guide the students' research work as well as their pre-degree practice.

Prior to the pre-degree practice, students receive an individual assignment from their supervisor that corresponds to the research subject. Upon the completion of practice, a progress report is prepared and presented to a board with members who belong to the professional audit organization.

The Master thesis advisors are appointed based on the professional and scientific interests both of the students and the academic staff. The appointment is discussed at a chair meeting. When an advisor has been chosen, the subject is approved and the Master's thesis is developed.

In sum, the academic faculty of the programme have professional and teaching experience and they have an adequate qualification to teach the Master's degree. They are highly regarded by students and graduates. However, it would be desirable to increase the number of members of the Faculty with a scientific degree. The scientific output in indexed journals (Web of Science) and the low number of external R&D projects and contracts are the main weaknesses of the programme, as it is recognized by the Quality Assurance System of the institution in their list of quality indicators. It would be advisable to pay attention to these indicators and design a Plan for Improvement in these respects. A serious difficulty, that such a plan has to overcome, is the high level of teaching hours of the Faculty, which may be preventing them from dedicating enough time to basic research.

Nevertheless, and taking into account the institutional constraints governing the teaching hours, some Improvement Plan is needed to address the detected weaknesses.

### ***Recommendations***

RECOMMENDATION 7.- Given the University objective to reach international standards concerning research, it is recommended to take actions leading to improve the indicators measuring the number of external R&D projects and the number of publications in the Web of Science.

***Assessment:*** SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLIANT

## CRITERION 5. INFRASTRUCTURES, FACILITIES AND RESOURCES

### *Comments*

The Masters programme has adequate funding and enables the use of modern materials and technical resources. The Masters programme uses five classrooms and a computer room. There is a special IT room for internships, with software and online support provided by a collaborating firm (Action Grappa Glavbukh LLC.)

Classrooms are furnished to ensure barrier-free access for people with health impairments. The buildings have wheelchair ramps and elevators. All of the University's material and technical resources are accessible to students with physical health impairments.

The library is well organised and it contains an excellent number of books, journals, and databases related to the specific program.

Each student has individual unlimited access to one or more electronic library system and/or electronic libraries that contain all titles in the required reading lists of the subject/module/practice/internship study programmes throughout the study period.

Moreover, the library collection consists of printed and electronic editions pertaining to the basic subjects as well as further reading in general and professional subjects.

All students and teachers can presently use 15 electronic databases free of charge.

The learning process involves a Telecommunication Information Educational System (TIES).

The administration uses advanced technology to ensure the confidentiality of personal data as well as data collected through on-line registration forms filled out by users to ensure the best data protection possible.

Although there is not a formal office providing the services of academic/professional support, these services are made available to students through the tutors. It is positive that in the website in English (<http://eng.rudn.ru/>), there is information about the admissions, residency, life in the campus, careers and jobs, and alumni services and association. However, the mentioned website has several sections under construction.

All of the mentioned support elements are well valued by the different stakeholders.

### ***Recommendations***

RECOMMENDATION 8.- For the programme implementation, the modern material and technical resources are used in the higher educational institution. The work of the educational information library center is well organized. For more convenient work, it is recommended to

renew the furniture in the classrooms (tables and chairs) of the institute.

**Assessment:** FULLY COMPLIANT

## CRITERION 6. LEARNING OUTCOMES

### *Comments*

The training activities, the methodology, and the evaluation systems allow the achievement of the skills and objectives of the degree program. They are also highly valued by the students, graduates, and employers. The employers are satisfied with the abilities of graduates and also the students who are in internships.

The marks for the students of the entry years 2015, 2016, and 2017 are very good (100% passed and more than 40% with Grade 5).

Similarly, in the state exams of the first graduation year (2017), 17 students (68% of the total) had A, B grades, 3 (12%) C, and 5 (20%) E, D. Moreover, 17 students (68%) had marks A, B in the master dissertations.

A set of evaluation tools has been developed for each subject to assess the extent to which the subject has been mastered and the expected competences developed. Examples of evaluation tools for all subjects are included in the virtual campus.

In collaboration programmes, study periods at a Partner University are recognized by all other Partner Universities. In particular, the Agreement on Joint Student Training in Economics with the Tajik National University (TNU) and the Russian-Tajik (Slavonic) University, signed within the international agreement with the Shanghai Cooperation Organization.

A Final State Examination is carried out by the State Examination Board, which must include representatives of the business community, i.e. employers.

In general, the activities, contents and evaluation, are related to an adequate acquisition of competences at a Master level.

**Assessment:** FULLY COMPLIANT

## CRITERION 7. SATISFACTION AND PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

### *Comments*

The RUDN Monitoring Research Center carries out global surveys known as Satisfaction Monitoring every three years, following the order of the RUDN Rector's Office. The surveys are

aimed at assessing the education quality at the University as reported by students as well as instructors, who are directly involved in the learning process. The data are used for comparative analysis, and the satisfaction of the different stakeholders is taken into account to improve the programme.

Students have a real opportunity to assess the quality of education at RUDN and submit the results to the University's Academic Council. The data on the satisfaction with education quality of the members of the Economic Faculty was high (84%) in 2017. The data on the satisfaction with education quality of students of the Economics Faculty was relatively high (76.67%) in 2017. However, the level of participation in both surveys is unknown.

In addition, the University is involved in a continuous improvement process. It is reported that RUDN University is one of the best world-class universities in Russia, ranked by Times Higher Education World University Rankings, QS World University Rankings and Round University Ranking. It is among the leaders in the categories "International students" and "Student-to-staff ratio" and the greenest university in Russia according to UI GreenMetric Ranking. RUDN is the first university in Russia to get 5 QS stars in 5 ranking categories.

Apart from global surveys, the Dean's Office/Educational Office Management carries out student surveys to estimate the quality of instruction in a certain subject/module and student workload so that the subject/module can be amended. The results are discussed at the meetings of the chair and Methodological Councils for Specializations and Fields of Study. The respective programmes are amended as agreed during the discussion to improve education quality.

Concerning employability, all graduates of the programme are employed by audit companies. Employers' satisfaction is assessed through surveys carried out within the framework of events organised by the University and attended by them, i.e. round-table discussions, chair meetings, training sessions, and workshops. The graduation rate is 100%.

There is no doubt that the Master is sustainable, with an estimated demand of at least 20 new students per year.

To sum up, the different indicators show general satisfaction with the degree.

**Assessment:** FULLY COMPLIANT