AKKORK

Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Career Development

Analytical report on the results of external assessment of the educational programs in 2017

Moscow - 2018

1. Overview of the main factors determining the vocational education system development in the Russian Federation in 2017.

Higher education

In the field of higher education the main task is to increase the competitiveness of domestic universities in the world market. It is planned to achieve success in this field by including Russian universities in the world best universities ranking, as well as the formation of flagship universities, centers for innovation, technological and social development of the region. According to the 2017 competitive selection results, 51 universities from 39 constituent entities of the Russian Federation (including 22 flagship universities, 10 federal universities, 3 national research universities) received the status of the regional innovative, technological and social development center. In the future it is planned to create such centers in each territorial entity of the country.

By now the university mass screening is completed. According to Rosobrnadzor four-year work results, the number of accredited universities has decreased: from 2605 in 2013 to 1100 in 2017. The number of non-state universities branches has also decreased: from 523 to 56.

It is planned to change the grounds for universities accreditation: it's planned to verify not their work formal results, but the real level of their student's knowledge.

The priorities of the Russian Federation Government in the field of higher education are reflected in such priority projects as "Universities as the innovation creation space centers" and "Modern digital educational environment in the Russian Federation". In 2017 an information resource as part of the project "Modern Digital Educational Environment in the Russian Federation" was launched, providing a one-stop access to online courses with the ability to master the educational programs disciplines of secondary vocational and higher education remotely. The information resource bank includes over 450 courses represented by 13 online educational platforms.

As for the project "Universities as creating innovation space centers" according to the results of 2017 the TOP-100 global rankings included 11 universities, and the TOP-300 global rankings included 13 Russian universities.

Secondary vocational education

In order to train personnel for regional economies in the most popular, new and promising professions and specialties (TOP-50), 44 federal state educational standards of secondary vocational education (FSES SVE) from the list of TOP-50 were developed and approved within the priority project framework of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia. At the beginning of the 2017/18 school year, more than 1,400 colleges and 58 universities, which admitted 86 thousand students received licenses for the relevant educational programs implementation and began to work on new FSESs.

2017 pilot testing in the SVE system of the WorldSkills demonstration exam, which covered 14 000 students from 240 educational institutions, was successful because it allowed to form approaches to an independent assessment of the SVE graduates training quality. Following the results of the priority project implementation, according to WorldSkills Russia standards, by the year 2017 103 specialized centers of competence (SCC) were accredited in the territory entities of the Russian Federation, including 86 in 2017. In 2017 a consistent level of WorldSkills standards compliance was attained by 2505 graduates (the planned value of the indicator was 2.5 thousand people). For the first time within the priority project framework the conditions for teachers and job-training instructors have been provided, as well as for WorldSkills experts. 5024 teachers (job-training instructors) from 85 constituent entities of the Russian Federation and 5699 WorldSkills experts completed advanced training on the basis of the WorldSkills standards.

Among the most significant events in 2017 there was the successful debut of the Russian team at the 44 World Skills Championship WorldSkills 2017 (October 2017, Abu Dhabi (UAE), they took the first place in the team competition, winning 11 medals.

Independent education quality assessment

On December 27, 2017 at the meeting of the Public Council were considered the amendments, introduced by the Federal Law dated December 5, 2017 No. 392-FL “On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation on the Improvement of Independent Evaluation of the Service Conditions Quality given by organizations in the sectors of culture, health care, education, social services and given by federal institutions of medical and social expertise", in the current legislation of the independent education quality assessment field (IEQA). By the Federal Law No. 392-FL, in addition to specifying amendments (with regard to the IEQA concept in focus terms of an independent assessment specifically on assessing the quality of the conditions for the educational activities

implementation), are introduced: a new forming public councils procedure is held through public chambers under the appropriate level government bodies, with authority three-year term limitation and specification of government bodies, associations and organizations whose representatives cannot be members of such councils (i.e. operating in the field of education) - Heads and their deputies, employees of organizations operating in this area); definition of the educational organizations for which IEQA cannot be conducted, these include educational organizations of the penitentiary system and under the jurisdiction of the Prosecutor General's Office of the Russian Federation, the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation, the Foreign Intelligence Service of the Russian Federation, the federal executive body in the field of security, the federal executive body authorized to accomplish tasks in the field of civil defense, and other "force authorities"; a new evaluation criterion is accessibility of services for people with disabilities; IEQA results as an indicator of the work effectiveness of the Heads of educational organizations and relevant levels government bodies.

2. The comparative analysis results of the expert reports on independent evaluation, professional public and international accreditation of educational programs for 2017.

The data set of the final expert reports of AKKORK agency on the results of external evaluation procedures, professional public and international accreditation, conducted in 2017, allows to present a cross-section of the current development of the higher education market in the Russian Federation according to the quality criteria applied by the agency.

I. LEARNING OUTCOMES QUALITY

1.1. Customer satisfaction with training results

1.2. Direct competency assessment by the experts

As part of the external assessment, the experts conducted surveys of employers, graduates, as well as a direct assessment of graduates' competencies, in which were usually used test materials prepared by an educational institution and recognized as valid by an expert, as well as questions focused on identifying professional and personal competencies of the graduates. A comparative analysis of the results of these events concludes that the share of employers who believe that the program graduates' competencies fully comply with the requirements for modern specialists in the industry, ranges from 60 to 90% on average. The share of

graduates fully satisfied with the quality of education received is higher and, depending on the program, ranges from 63 to 100%.

Also, the experts selectively get acquainted with the Graduate qualification works of 2017 (or the previous year) in this area. The reviewed GQWs basically indicate that the scope and quality of analytical and theoretical work, the quality of analysis and the solution of the tasks are aimed at confirming the formation of the core competencies. The topics of the GQWs correspond to the educational programs name and the current level of science development, engineering and technology in their relevant fields. According to the experts, in most cases the topics and issues of GQWs are quite complex, and the degree of use of the research tools variety is assessed as high.

At the same time, among the identified problems, there is indicated an insufficient (in some cases) level of the GQW originality, a low degree of the relevant departments research results usage, of foreign experience and methods of comparative analysis.

It is recommended to promote the development of abstract thinking, autonomy and independence among students in the usage of information retrieval methods, its interpretation, logic and categorization.

It is also proposed, when writing a GQW, to use practical case analysis.

In some cases, the experts recommend increasing the degree of internationalization of the program at all levels: foreign language learning by students throughout their studies; an increase in the number of student and teacher exchange programs, scholarships, participation in international competitions.

One of the frequent recommendations, which was also indicated in a large part of reports from previous years, is that the practical application of the GQW results in many cases is only potential, but not real, and consists in the need to expand the areas of practical application of the GQW, in particular in receiving orders from employers.

II. EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE

2.1. Strategy, objectives and program management

The experts positively assess the fact that large regional universities (for example, Samara STU, SKFU, TSTU) form the strategies of their programs in close connection with the regional development strategy. The strategy implementation is carried out jointly with government authorities, local governments, other professional institutions and organizations.

It is also important to note that according to the comparative analysis results of the AKKORK expert reports for 2017, it can be concluded that the interaction of program managers with employers in terms of educational programs creating and update (as compared to the data of annual reports of AKKORK in previous years) is enhanced. In particular, the practice of an annual discussion of the man vocational education program at the expanded Chair meetings with the involvement of employers and the scientific community representatives, the definition and implementation of the strategy for the development of the main educational program with the active participation of the Educational program Council, which includes employers and representatives of business communities, etc.

The education quality control is carried out using annual monitoring of students opinions.

Among the problems identified, one of the most frequent is incomplete teacher satisfaction with the motivation system: based on polls conducted by the experts, from 0 to 35% of teachers consider the motivation system insufficient. As a recommendation, the need to encourage teachers for methodical work, publications, etc. is given.

The most common recommendation on this criterion is a proposal to organize basic Chairs (branches of Chairs) of a higher education institution at profile enterprises, as well as to open at faculties basic Chairs representing well-known foreign and Russian companies operating in their respective industries.

In addition, the experts recommend that Educational program managers should consider the possibility of their programs benchmarking with programs offered by other educational organizations, as well as to develop cooperation with leading Russian universities for the implementation of academic mobility programs for students.

The general course on the internationalization of education is reflected in such expert recommendations as the orientation of the educational program's development strategy towards the expansion of international cooperation, the attraction of foreign students, the development of network education and e-learning.

2.2. Structure and content of the program

The data collected by the experts during site visits show that the overwhelming majority of students (an average of 90%) express an opinion on the main educational program structure and content high compliance with their

expectations. In general, the proportion of academic disciplines (courses) developed with the participation of employers is recognized as sufficient (it ranges from 27% to 100%).

A number of reports indicated that the competency model of the graduate correlates with the approved professional standards. The experts note a rational combination of theoretical courses, practical exercises and research work, as well as a good balance between the structure and content of the educational program.

At the same time, according to the experts' opinion, in many cases the experience of similar programs implemented by both Russian and foreign universities is used insufficiently. It is recommended to harmonize the content of educational programs with educational programs of leading foreign universities, to increase the level of academic mobility and use the potential of the program in the framework of international projects, network programs.

Also among the recommendations on this assessment criterion there is a proposal to diversify the program's focus, regulate the mechanisms of employers' involvement in analysis and design of the content of the educational program, and also introduce mandatory subjects or one module aimed at developing Soft Skills (organizational and management skills, team management, conflict management, negotiation skills, personal development).

2.3. Educational materials

A comparative analysis of the expert reports for 2017 shows that the departments implementing educational programs that have passed the evaluation, attract representatives of interested organizations to the formation of content, examination and review of educational programs and (or) their components. The educational materials share agreed with key social partners representing the labor market is very high and averages 70-80%. The educational materials contain testing and assessment materials (TAM) developed on the basis of real practical situations (in a greater degree), as well as TAM, submitted by employers (to a far smaller extent).

While the degree of educational materials provision in electronic form is at average recognized as sufficient (and exceeds the similar indicators of previous years), recommendations from the experts still include recommendations for completing work on creating an electronic library, multimedia textbooks on main (basic) courses, etc.

One of the problems identified by this criterion is that more than 50% of the analyzed reports indicate that students are not sufficiently involved in the process

of educational materials development and updating (poll found that from 15 to 65% of students believe that their opinion is not taken into account when developing and updating the educational materials).

Also from interviews with employers the experts concluded that a number of graduate Chairs implementing main educational programs did not sufficiently involve representatives of interested organizations in the development of educational and methodical materials, and the coordination of educational materials with key partners representing the labor market is carried out at an expanded Chair meeting with the participation of employers that is a fairly formal procedure. In this regard, the experts recommend to involve the representatives of interested organizations in the development and updating of the program's educational and methodical materials more actively: for example, to coordinate the list of disciplines included in the program curriculum, the main topics and a summary of some Chair disciplines.

Besides, according to the experts' opinion, many main educational program managers should regulate with the university statutory documents the frequency and methods of updating the educational materials, taking into account changing conditions in the Federal, regional and local labor markets and internal monitoring of the education quality.

2.4. Technologies and methods of educational activities

Based on a comparative analysis of AKKORK expert reports for 2017, it can be claimed that the educational technologies and methods used in lectures, practical and laboratory classes of all main educational programs that have passed the evaluation, contribute to the effective formation of the stated educational standard competencies. Interactive techniques are actively used: the share of conducting classes in an interactive form averages 37%. In the framework of practical exercises, case-methods, methods for solving problems that contribute to the formation of practical skills associated with the future professional activity of the program graduates are used. Such forms of training as master classes, trainings, round tables, etc. are applied.

A more intensive formation of knowledge, skills and possessions, the individualization of learning is promoted by the widespread introduction of a point-rating assessment system into the educational process.

Many of the accredited programs are implemented using an electronic learning system (for example, Pegasus, E-Campus, Vita LMS). At the same time, a comparative analysis of the final expert reports shows that in Russian higher

education there is a situation of differentiation in terms of the level of e-learning development: whereas in some universities this level allows the full use of new educational methods to improve the quality and accessibility of the educational programs training, in others the introduction of e-learning is still not completed or is even at an early stage. In this regard, the popular experts' recommendation is to speed up work on the usage of platforms and e-learning tools.

2.5. Teaching staff

A comparative analysis of AKKORK final expert reports for 2017 indicates that the university teaching staff of the absolute majority of main educational programs is characterized by a high level of qualification, availability of education in the relevant field and a sufficient degree of academic titles and degrees. A significant share of teachers participating in implementation of educational programs combine their university employment with professional activities by occupation, thus providing a high degree of training result approximation to labor market requirements.

Many of the reports analyzed note that there is a share of teachers who are not satisfied (or not fully satisfied) with the motivation system, in some cases reaching 40%.

Regarding the succession pipeline some reports noted sufficient achievements of main educational programs' management, while in some reports the proposal to focus efforts on talent pipeline still remained a relevant recommendation.

The majority of university institutions implement teaching staff assessment system, and the results of such assessment are taken into account during the teaching staff competition for the position.

The most common recommendation of the experts in relation to this evaluation criterion concerns the internationalization: it is recommended to increase the number of teachers' international mobility programs jointly with other foreign universities, pay attention to professional development of the teaching staff in leading university institutions of the Russian Federation and abroad, expand scientific and education projects with foreign colleagues. Also, the experts pointed out the need of increasing the publication activity of the university teaching staff, in international editions included.

2.6. Technical and financial resources of the program

According to the analyzed expert reports for 2017, universities, whose educational programs have passed the evaluation, have a material and technical base that provides for all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, laboratory, practical and research work of students, which are envisaged by the curriculum, and relevant sanitary and fire safety rules and regulations. Bases of Industry-focused Practical Training are equipped with up-to-date equipment and devices, special purpose testing areas to a degree required for vocational competencies development.

The majority of reports note that the availability of education for people with special needs is provided by means of unhindered access for students to educational institutions, dining halls, public conveniences, and other facilities of the education institution. It is as well evident that the process of making the education available for physically challenged students is still incomplete: a part of reports contained the recommendation to provide more conditions for students with health limitations (elevators, special seat for a sign language interpreter, acoustic signals for acoustically challenged people, etc.).

As for the financial support of the main educational programs, the experts noted the availability of transparent, documented processes of budgeting necessary for the implementation of programs, the effectiveness of the allocated resources use during the implementation of the programs, development plan and improvement of educational, material and technical resources of the program to maintain and improve the quality of education. The practice of some main educational programs managers on the systematic involvement of employers in improving the material and technical base of the program has been recorded.

At the same time, the experts recommend considering the possibility of cooperation with companies and government entities (future employers for students) in terms of funding programs through the establishment of scholarships. It is also recommended to enter into contracts with IT-companies for the purpose of purchasing licensed software (for example, 1C), thus allowing students to work with workable software ad obtain necessary knowledge that will assist in fulfillment of one’s potential on the labor market.

2.7. Program information resources

The expert reports for 2017 indicate that the educational organizations that have undergone AKKORK external assessment use electronic databases of educational and methodical materials and scientific literature (the repository of digital and scientific materials on the university portal, the electronic library).

The strength of most evaluated programs is the educational process implementation using the electronic educational environment functioning at the university, especially the electronic university library, which includes among other things a subscription to various electronic library systems, electronic journals, etc. At the same time some reports indicate that the information resources available to the educational organization contain an insufficient number of periodical foreign publications (magazines). The experts recommend providing access to periodical scientific and foreign journals on Internet resources and foreign industry information databases.

As examples of good practices are those universities and programs where information and communication technologies (ICT) are used in management processes, in activity planning, in the process of providing electronic document management, in the instructions monitoring system, for maintaining the students database and forming their electronic portfolio, for maintaining the teachers database, planning of the training schedule, for the formation of curricula and discipline programs, for planning and accounting of the teaching staff workload, for organizing feedback from students, graduates and employers, including data collecting on the quality of teaching, to inform about the programs/services implemented by the faculty.

However, this practice is not common in all universities. In this regard, the use of ICT in the management and implementation of the educational process is a topical recommendation. Besides, some reports contain the recommendation to the teachers of the program to be actively involved in the possibilities actualization of using ICTs already provided by the university.

2.8. Scientific research

According to the comparative analysis results of the expert reports, it was concluded that the share of the use of scientific research work in the educational process and in the system of organizing the management of educational activities in educational organizations is quite high (up to 80%). According to the results of meetings with students and graduates of educational programs, the experts concluded that the research activity orientation is practical. At the same time a

much smaller proportion of scientific research (in some cases, no more than 5%) finds practical application in the real sector of the economy. In this regard, it is recommended to increase the number of scientific research on the industrial enterprises inquiry.

Teachers and students of evaluated programs take an active part in All-Russian and international scientific conferences. At the same time, in a number of universities, there is a lack of scientific ties with foreign countries. One of the main recommendations of the experts is to develop a set of activities aimed to establish scientific relations with foreign countries. It is proposed to hold joint conferences, participate in international projects and conduct cross-country research, publish scientific monographs and manuals in foreign publishing houses with the goal of recognizing scientists and researchers in the international arena and expanding collaboration with foreign colleagues.

2.9. Employers' participation in the implementation of the program

As follows from the analyzed expert reports, most employers note that they are highly satisfied with the competencies of the graduates. At the same time, the interest of employers in graduates does not always rely on the possibility of providing material remuneration that meets the needs of graduates.

In comparison with the AKKORK annual reports of previous years, there is a higher degree of the educational organizations interaction with employers: the representatives of employers are not only the members of Educational and Methodical and State examination commissions, they also take part in the work of the Educational programs Council and the board; besides they take an active part in the examination of educational programs in terms of meeting professional standards and requirements of the modern labor market, participate in shaping the practice-oriented disciplines content, the actual practice and research work; they are directly involved in the formulation of research topics, term papers, final qualifying works of students, as well as in the examination of these topics for compliance with the requirements of the labor market. According to educational organizations, employers are involved in the formation of competences maps and matrices, in particular, in the formation of the basic educational results content and general professional and professional competencies descriptors, however, according to the experts, sometimes this work is formal.

Also the experts recommend the main educational program managers to entice the employers into participation in program implementation through the provision of material and financial resources, including the form of employer

scholarships for the best students. A frequent recommendation is to develop and put in place regular mechanisms for encouraging employers to participate in the program implementation. In addition, it is proposed to combine the efforts of educational organizations and representatives of employers to develop a guidebook for a student on practices and on labor adaptation.

2.10. Student participation in determining program content

According to the comparative analysis of the AKKORK expert reports for 2017, students of all the programs that have passed the examination participate in the management of the program through the Student Councils. In most cases, all information received through them is processed and receives a response (some reports recommend reducing the response time).

The educational programs content is regularly updated based on the results of the student survey.

Students can participate in the educational programs quality monitoring. Depending on the program, the monitoring procedure can be initiated either by the Chair, faculty or university, or by the students themselves.

At the same time, according to the results of student surveys conducted by the experts during site visits, a significant proportion of students are not sufficiently aware of their ability to influence program content. It is recommended to conduct additional explanatory and motivational work in the matter of the possibility of students influence on the educational process management.

Also, the experts recommend developing the Chair and the faculty incentives of the student participation in determining the content of the program and organizing the educational process. A number of reports contain a recommendation to specify the analytical approaches (to conduct a “pre-research”), used in studying the students’ opinions about individual aspects of the educational process, it will enhance the feedback effectiveness.

2.11. Student services at the program level

In most of the analyzed reports the experts conclude on the systematic and rather high level of student services organization. Educational organizations offer students a wide range of extracurricular activities: sports clubs, creative teams, etc. In some universities there is a developed system of social support for students: social scholarships and other payments to students from socially unprotected categories, granting students of the state-financed education form tours to

sanatoriums, as well as the possibility for students of a commercial educational basis to purchase the holiday packages at a reduced price, etc.

The experts point out the need to address the matter of providing students with the opportunity to get an educational loan in partner banks of educational organizations. It is also proposed to consider the possibility of the student's employment at the university, which may be the basis for obtaining a discount on tuition fees.

In some cases, it is recommended to review (and increase) funding for activities carried out as educational work.

In addition, the experts recommend conducting an internal research of the student's wishes and expectations in relation to student services through the questionnaires.

2.12. Occupational guidance. Evaluation of the applicants' training quality

As a comparative analysis of AKKORK the expert reports for 2017 showed, that in educational organizations that have undergone external evaluation a complex of various events for potential applicants is held annually: Doors Open Days, vocational guidance lectures in schools, participation in parent meetings, holding of cultural events for schoolchildren both on the basis of universities, and on the basis of other organizations. As to universities, structural units are provided for organizing and coordinating career guidance; there are competitions and courses for the Unified State Exam preparation.

The experts recommend to organize events aimed at attracting more applicants, including on the Internet, in social networks, and to attract applicants from abroad for training on a three-party agreements basis.

Also, according to the experts' opinions, it is important to carry out an analysis of career guidance, taking into account the results achieved: in particular, to keep an eye on those students who have successfully passed vocational guidance in the pre-university period.

Besides, the experts suggest that more attention should be paid to the development of the "School to University"| system of continuous education; "School-College-University" in study fields taking into account a possibility of profile development of training programs.

3. AKKORK activities statistics in 2017

HEI	Total of programs	Indep.eval.for Prof.public accreditation	Indep. evaluation of quality on the program level and public accred. incl. e-learning accreditation	International accreditation	QAA partner abroad
K.G. Razumovsky Moscow State University of technologies and management (the First Cossack University)	5	5	0	0	
Institute of Economic and Management in Industry	1	1	0	0	
Belgorod State National Research University	2	2	2	0	
Rostov State Economic University	4	4	4	0	
Plekhanov Russian University of Economics	2	2	1	0	
Samara State Technical University	11	11	0	0	
North Caucasus Federal University	5	5	5	0	
Saint Petersburg University	18	3	3	15	ZEvA
Tambov State Technical University	5	5	5	0	
Tyumen Industrial University	9	9			
RUDN University	2	0	0	2	DEVA-AAC
Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (RANEPA)	2	0	0	2	FIBAA
Podolsk College n.a. A.V. Nikulin	4	4	0	0	
Yamal multifield college	2	2			

TOTAL:	**72**	**53**	**20**	**19**	

HEI	12
College	2

Types of Accreditation	**Total number of programs**
Programs for professional public accreditation	53
Independent evaluation of quality on the program level and public accreditations	20
International accreditation (DEVA, ZEvA, FIBAA)	19

Geography of projects	**Total of EI**
Central Federal Region	8
North West Federal Region	1
South Federal Region	1
North Caucasus Federal Region	1
Volga Federal Region	1
Ural Federal Region	1
Far East Federal Region	1
Total	14

4. Summary

According to the AKKORK activity statistical results in 2017, professional public accreditation is the most popular of the publicly available independent quality assessment procedures. At the same time the interest of educational organizations in international and public accreditation is obvious, and there are grounds for predictions that the demand for these procedures among Russian universities will increase.

As a result of a comparative analysis of the final expert reports for 2017, the trend towards the internationalization of educational organizations and the expansion of inter-university cooperation becomes apparent. This is evidenced by the recommendations of the experts who evaluated educational programs on many criteria, taking into account the prospects for international cooperation and competitiveness at the international level. The experts aspire to focus the main educational program managers' attention on opportunities of increasing the mobility of students and teachers, to expand educational and scientific international contacts, to increase the recognition of Russian universities, programs and individual teachers abroad. The trend towards the inter-university cooperation development was manifested in a number of experts' recommendations on various evaluation criteria concerning the inter-university relations intensification in terms of exchange of experience, joint projects, benchmarking, etc.