AKKORK

Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Career Development

Analytical report on the results of external assessment of the educational programs in 2016

Moscow - 2017

1. Overview of the main factors determining the vocational education system development in the Russian Federation in 2016

Higher professional education

The volume and structure formation of the control figures admission (CFA) for training remains the key mechanism for ensuring accessibility of higher education. The requests of 13,000 key Russian employers were taken into account, when setting the CFA for higher education programs for the 2016/17 academic year. The total volume of the CFA set for the 2016/17 academic year was 529 thousand people. Over the past three years there has been an increase in the need for graduates in the natural sciences, engineering, pedagogical and medical fields of study and specialties. Based on this, the structure of full-time admission to Bachelor's and Specialist programs in 2016 was determined: 46.7% - CFA for engineering areas of training and specialty, 9.2% - for teaching, 8.4% - for medical ones.

To ensure the quality of higher education the Ministry annually monitors the effectiveness of the activities of universities and their branches. 830 state, non-state, municipal and regional educational organizations of higher education and 932 branches took part in the monitoring of the effectiveness in 2016. In 2016 the criteria for evaluating universities include such an indicator as the level of teachers' salaries. According to the results of 2016 effectiveness monitoring 58 educational institutions of higher education and 186 branches of universities accomplished less than four indicators, of which 12 universities and 95 branches were state-owned, 46 universities and 91 branches were non-state.

The work on updating the Federal State educational standards (FSES) of higher education and bringing them in line with the professional standards requirements has been carried on. 154 updated FSES of higher education have been approved. 428 FSES plans have been prepared, ensuring the inclusion of the professional standards requirements in educational practice. 204 of the FSES project passed the evaluation of the relevant professional qualifications councils.

In 2016, the support for 21 universities has been continued, they were selected as a result of the competition for the state support provision to leading universities of the Russian Federation in order to increase their competitiveness among the world's leading scientific and educational centers. In 2016, out of 21 universities, 20 are represented in three leading world rankings, 16 of them in The World University Rankings (THE), 13 in the QS World University Rankings, 1 for the first time in the Academic Ranking of World Universities (ARWU).

In 2016 in order to form a group of competitive regional universities, the Ministry of Education and Science conducted a competitive selection of flagship universities, in which 11 educational organizations became winners.

Secondary vocational education

In 2016, new Federal State educational standards of secondary vocational education were approved for 16 professions and 28 specialties, developed in accordance with the list of 50 most popular, new and promising professions requiring secondary vocational education (SVE) (TOP-50), approved by order of the

Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of the Russian Federation dated November 2, 2015 No. 83. As part of the State final certification, a mandatory demonstration exam is introduced. In 2016, Federal educational and methodical associations in the SVE system carried out active work on updating 275 FSES SVE to meet the requirements of professional standards.

In 2016 7 interregional centers of competence were established in seven constituent entities of the Russian Federation. Each ICC purchased modern and high-tech equipment for the TOP-50 and Worldskills competencies professions and specialties in order to prepare the Training Center for testing new FSES and develop experimental educational programs from the list of TOP-50 and further transfer of the best practices of personnel training to the system of secondary vocational education in Russia Federation.

The Ministry of Education and Science of Russia jointly with the Autonomous Non-Commercial Organization "Strategic Initiatives Agency of Promoting New Projects" implemented the project “Personnel training for meeting the requirements of high-tech industries based on dual education” in 13 regions of the Russian Federation. 105 educational organizations and more than 1 thousand enterprises took part in the project.

Legislation amendments.

In 2016 2 draft laws on amendments to the Federal Law “On Education in the Russian Federation” were prepared. The first one provides the improvement of the mechanism of target admission and target training and the possibility of concluding a three party agreement on target admission and training between the university, the customer and the applicant/student. The employer will also participate in the conclusion of the contract. It is important that the responsibility is fixed between all interested parties. An essential innovation is the mandatory three-year labor repayment of the graduate and the penalty payment for this default on obligation. The bill passed through public discussion and is under consideration in other interested executive authorities.

The purpose of the second bill is to remove unnecessary administrative barriers in creating basic departments. The draft law adoption will provide possibility to clarify the legal status of the basic unit, that is, it will be possible to partially carry out educational activities, to implement certain academic subjects, courses, disciplines (modules) in the unit. In addition, the bill will introduce a special approach to the educational activities licensing of those educational organizations that create basic units (their locations will not be indicated in the license): the law establishes the possibility of licensing such structural units as part of the university, which removes the excess requirements for the base units in terms of the need to implement the educational program on their sites in full. The draft law will allow the management of the base units to involve employees of organizations on the basis of which the base units are created.

Also in 2016, methodical recommendations on educational activities organization using online forms of educational programs were developed and posted on the website of the Ministry of Education and Science.

2. The comparative analysis results of the expert reports on independent evaluation and professional and public accreditation of educational programs for 2016

As a result of the expert reports comparative analysis for 2016, the main trends were identified for each of the evaluation criteria used by AKKORK when conducting an independent assessment and professional public accreditation of educational programs that are typical for this period for the work of educational organizations in the Russian Federation.

I. LEARNING OUTCOMES QUALITY

1.1. Direct competency assessment by the experts

In the process of site visits, the experts conducted a direct assessment of the graduates competencies, for which they usually used test materials prepared by an educational institution and recognized by the expert as valid, as well as questions focused on identifying graduates professional and personal competencies. As a result, a direct assessment determined the proportion of students whose level of knowledge is sufficient (coped with 80% or more of the proposed assignments), acceptable (50 to 79% of the assignments were completed) and low (the solved percentage of assignments was less than or equal to 49%). In conducting a direct assessment in all cases, the graduate students showed at average an adequate or acceptable level of knowledge.

In the course of the direct competency assessment, the experts got acquainted with the Graduate qualification works in the amount of not less than 25% of the graduation works of the previous year in this area. As a result of the assessment of Graduate qualification works (GQWs) for compliance with the established requirements, the experts concluded that most of the GQWs in their subject correspond to the direction of training and the current level of science development in the field of the program, and the tasks and content of the GQWs are aimed at confirming the graduates competencies. Compared with the trends of previous years, there is a positive trend in terms of the timeliness and relevance of GQWs, there has been observed a high level in selected research methods and the adequacy of the interpretation of the results obtained. The practical significance of the work is noted in cases where the educational program has an applied nature (clinical psychology, design and technology of electronic devices). So the topics of the GQWs are formed at the request of employers and/or they contain recommendations for solving real case studies/practical problems.

However, research results are not always communicated to employers and are not always implemented in practice. There is no feedback from employers about the relevance and impact of the recommendations described in the GQWs.

When guiding graduation theses, it has been proposed to increase the degree of employers' use of the research results carried out in the course of practice and term papers.

II. EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE

2.1. Strategy, objectives and program management

The strategies of most programs are designed in accordance with applicable standards, industry-specific labor market requirements. The objectives of educational programs are agreed with the representatives of the labor market. However, students, and in isolated cases, teachers are not always well informed and can clearly define them. The criteria and indicators used in conducting an internal audit are not always coordinated with employers.

Compared to the previous year, the awareness of the importance of the quality management system in education has increased significantly. In all large educational organizations, the system of internal monitoring of the quality of education has been developed, implemented and continues to be improved at program levels.

At the program management level the analysis of the current competitive environment is not always carried out.

2.2. Structure and content of the program

The structure and content of all evaluated programs fully comply with the requirements of the FSES. In addition, a significant portion of programs other than FSES competencies take into account specific competencies proposed by potential employers. In general, the structure and content correspond to the goals and objectives of the educational program (EP) and the needs of the region.

Also, a students survey shows that, in most cases, the structure and content of the program correspond to their expectations.

However, to improve this criterion, experts often recommend the following:

- involvement of employers in the development and updating of educational and methodical materials of the program;
- enticing the employers to the choice of educational methods used;
- an increase in the number of hours of practice (wishes both of students and employers);
- increase in study time for practice-oriented disciplines (the wish of employers).

Currently, in most educational organizations of the Russian Federation, the ability of a student to choose and form their own learning path is not realized at proper level.

2.3. Teaching materials

Compared to the previous year, the level of coordination of the teaching and methodical complex (TMC) with employers has increased. However, the degree of involvement of students in the TMC development remains insufficient. A common recommendation is to conduct a more open policy on the formation of the EP content and structure and the involvement of students in the formation of the TMC content.

Compared to the previous year, there are no complaints about the practice-oriented content of testing and assessment materials (TAM); the use of managerial situations, mini-cases, creativity tasks aimed at identifying formed competencies is noted.

However, in some cases, it is recommended to update the TMC, especially in the part of reading list, in particular, to include modern periodical literature. This will allow updating the program and ensuring students awareness of modern research and innovative science achievements.

There are recommendations to increase TMC information openness, namely, the publication of syllabi of disciplines and other elements of the methodical complex on the site.

2.4. Technologies and methods of educational activities

In all of the evaluated programs, the teaching staff applies business games, discussions, project defense, brainstorming and other active learning methods during the educational process.

In many educational organizations, within the framework of studies, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, state and public organizations, and master classes of experts and specialists are provided.

If in 2014 it was noted in the reports that many educational organizations have included the implementation of e-learning at the program level in the strategy to improve the quality and accessibility of training, in 2016 the e-leaning platforms are actively functioning. However, the system as a whole and its individual elements continue to evolve. Thus, by adjusting the adaptation of personnel to work in the system, the system of motivation of teaching staff is formed and improved, aimed at enhancing the creation of electronic courses and other forms of active use of the electronic platform in the educational process.

2.5. Teaching staff

In most cases, teachers of the department are actively involved in conducting research, the results of which are in educational process demand. In this case, in a number of programs the need to increase the level of degree has been noted.

The question of the age-related imbalance of the teaching staff remains relevant, which is reflected in the recommendations on the need for more active involvement of young personnel and the formation of “up-to-date” personnel reserve.

In comparison with the previous period, there is a tendency to attract specialists to teaching activity who have current practical experience in the discipline profile.

The Russian universities personnel in general are loyal to the educational organization in which they work, but more often in the course of interviewing in site visits, there is a constructive criticism of personnel policy and motivation systems; recommendations and suggestions for improvement are expressed.

2.6. Technical and financial resources

During the site visits the absolute majority of experts concluded that the financial, material and technical resources generated for the implementation of the educational program make it possible to fully ensure its high-quality realization.

In most cases, EPs do not have their own budget, and their financing is carried out within the framework of the general budget of the university. Consequently,

program management is very limited in its ability to influence financial decisions. In this regard, a number of expert reports included a recommendation to consider the possibility of forming a separate program budget and giving greater authority to budget management programs.

The recommendations on the activation or formation of ways to obtain additional financial resources for the development of material and technical base are relevant, for example, the implementation of scientific and technical achievements of teachers and students.

The development of infrastructure for training persons with disabilities has become an urgent topic.

2.7. Program information resources

Students of all evaluated EPs are provided with access to the electronic library system containing publications on the main studied disciplines and formed with the approval of the copyright holders of educational and methodical literature. In addition, distance-learning support systems are being introduced to store educational content and provide it to students in educational organizations, but the process of setting up the system continues.

In several reports, the recommendation indicates the need to adjust the work of student's personal offices, to create services in the system that will allow students and teachers to exchange information.

The importance of creating the official pages of the educational program/faculty in social networks is noted. The recommendations on the information layout about teachers and their research activities or practical experience are of current concern.

2.8. Scientific research

According to the data of all the analyzed reports, the research activities of the teaching staff of the evaluated programs correspond to the profile of specialists training and are based on fundamental and applied scientific research. The results of research works are aimed at developing priority fields for the faculty and the educational organization as a whole.

Based on the surveys results on the topic "How does scientific research work affect the quality of education" conducted among students, it can be concluded that SRW has a positive effect on the quality of education.

Compared to the previous year, the following recommendations remain relevant:

- to intensify the involvement in the work of scientific circles, conducting SRW;

- to organize work on the commercialization of the SRW results, create conditions for material incentives for contractual and grant activities of the teaching staff and students, use of research results at the national and international levels.

2.9. Employers' participation in the implementation of the program

In all reports, the criterion score is above average. According to the expert reports, employers are attracted at the planning and implementation stages of the program, as well as in assessing the final competencies of graduate students. Employers participate in the competencies matrix formation, they are members of the collegial management bodies at different levels (Academic Council of the University, Chair meetings); they develop and update the discipline programs content, educational and testing and assessment materials, practice programs, Graduation Qualification work topics; they implement students practice guidance, supervising and reviewing of the GQWs; they are involved in the assessment of GQWs and are included in the examination boards of students final attestation.

As part of the EP assessment in this criterion, the experts conducted a survey of employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduates training. According to the survey results, at average (according to the analyzed expert reports for 2016), 80% of employers are fully satisfied with the quality of graduate training.

2.10. Students participation in determining program content

In accordance with the data of the expert reports, in the absolute majority of educational organizations, student self-government bodies have been created. Students participating in the work of these bodies can in one way or another influence the decision-making on the organization and management of the learning process.

It remains relevant that a significant part of students are not fully informed about the opportunities of participation in solving issues related to the organization and management of the educational process. In addition, in part of the reports it is noted that students do not have sufficient motivation to actively participate in such work, in particular in shaping the content of the program.

Based on the data obtained, the experts recommend to develop the incentives system for students' active participation in EP management, to involve students more actively in the program management activity, both through self-governing bodies and through the establishment of active feedback through the student's personal account, and also to bring to the students' attention full information about the educational process management participation and the existing incentives.

2.11. Student services at the program level

Traditionally, state educational organizations in Russia provide ample opportunities to participate in extracurricular activities of an educational organization. The absolute majority of educational organizations regularly hold mass cultural and sport events for students, organize regular conferences, seminars, and asset schools that allow them to form the most necessary personal and social competencies.

It is recommended to organize employment training, to provide an opportunity for psychological assistance, to complete the creation of training conditions for persons with disabilities.

2.12. Occupation guidance. Evaluation of the applicants' training quality

The absolute majority of the analyzed expert reports contain information that as part of career guidance activities for EP recruitment, various types of events were held: open-door days, vocational guidance lectures in schools, participation in parental meetings, cultural events for schoolchildren, Academic competitions in general subjects and the involvement of Academic competition participants in the work of student Scientific circles.

Besides, most educational organizations have created opportunities for preparing applicants for entrance tests and passing the Uniform State Exam. The consultative assistance to potential applicants is provided within the framework of interuniversity events, such as the exhibition "Education and Career", "Fair of Professions", etc.

There are recommendations for the development of distance career guidance, which will increase the geography of educational organizations in this field (to work with applicants not only within the region).

The importance of career guidance events for Bachelor's students has been noted.

In general, experts estimate the level of educational organizations' work in vocational guidance and applicants training as high.

3. AKKORK statistics for 2016

HEI	Total number of programs	Indep.eval. for Prof.public accred	Indep. evaluation of quality on the programme level and public accreditation incl. e-learning accreditation	Int.accred	QAA partner abroad
National Research Ogarev Mordovia State University	9	8	1	0	
Institute of Economics and Management in Industry	1	1	0	0	
National Research Tomsk State University	2	2	0	0	
National Research University Higher School of Economics	7	7	0	0	
Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN)	1	0	0	1	DEVA-AAC
Plekhanov Russian University of Economics	4	4	1	0	
Peter the Great St. Petersburg Polytechnic University	2	2	0	0	
Siberian Federal University	6	6	1[1]	0	
State University Dubna	14	14	3	0	
TOTAL:	**46**	**44**	**6**	**1**	
Khimki Technical College Intrafields cooperation	2	2	0	0	
Technological College № 34"	1	1	0	0	
Sergiev Posad College	2	2	0	0	
Narofominsk Technical college	2	2	0	0	
Total:	**7**	**7**	**0**	**0**	
Total:	**53**	**51**	**6**	**1**	

[1] E-learning accreditation Siberian Federal University

HEI	9
College	4

Types of Accreditation	**Total number of programs**
Programs for professional-public accreditation	53
Independent evaluation of quality on the programme level and public accreditation	6
Int.accred (DEVA, ZEvA, FIBAA)	1
E-learning accreditation	1

Geography of projects	**HEI**
Central Federal Region	9
North West Federal Region	1
South Federal Region	0
North Caucasus Federal Region	0
Volga Federal Region	1
Ural Federal Region	0
Far East Federal Region	0
Siberian Federal Region	2
Total	**13**

4. Summary.

All educational programs that have undergone AKKORK independent assessment and professional public accreditation with AKKORK participation in 2016 demonstrated a sufficient level of learning outcomes quality and education quality assurance, which made it possible to come to a positive decision on their accreditation. At the same time, a comparative analysis of the expert reports for 2016 reveals the general development trends and the most common problems faced by educational organizations during the EP implementation.

Compared to the previous year, the awareness of the importance of the quality management system in education has increased significantly. In all large educational organizations, it is has been developed, implemented and continues to be improved at program levels.

Compared to the previous year, there are no complaints about the practice-oriented content of testing and assessment materials; the use of managerial situations, mini-cases, creativity tasks and aimed at identifying formed competencies has been noted.

In many educational organizations, within the framework of studies, meetings with representatives of Russian and foreign companies, state and public organizations, and master classes of experts and specialists are provided.

In comparison with the previous period, there is a tendency to attract specialists to the teaching activity who have current practical experience in the discipline field.

The development of infrastructure for training persons with disabilities has become an urgent topic.

If in 2014 it has been noted in the reports that many educational organizations have included the implementation of e-learning at the program level in their strategy to improve the quality and accessibility of training, in 2016 the e-leaning platforms are actively functioning. However, the system as a whole and its individual elements continue to evolve.

Currently, in most educational organizations of the Russian Federation, the ability of a student to choose and form their own learning path is not realized at proper level. Next year the educational organizations should pay more attention for students' motivation in designing the program structure and creating conditions for individualizing the learning path.